Sex change in multiple gender sufferers is associated with Islamic law and the Population Administration Law

Azalia Rahma Utami1, Djanuardi2, Linda Rachmainy3

1, 2, 3 Faculty of Law, Universitas Padjadjaran, Indonesia

*Email: Azalia19001@mail.unpad.ac.id

**ARTICLE INFO**

**ABSTRACT**

The phenomenon of transsexuality and sex change is still something that is considered taboo or should not be done by Indonesian society, the reason is because our country upholds religious values, traditions and eastern values adopted by society. Keep in mind that not everyone is born with normal conditions. There are some people who experience gender ambiguity or in medical terms called ambiguous genitalia or sex ambiguity and Islamic jurisprudence studies, this group of people is referred to as khunsa or double gender. The results of this study show that Law Number 23 of 2006 concerning Population Administration opens up opportunities for sex change by submitting a sex change application to the court so that the event can be recorded at the relevant agency. Judging from Islamic law, Islamic law also allows sex change if done for someone suffering from multiple gender conditions (khunsa) as a form of treatment as stipulated in Fatwa No. 03/MUNASVIII/MUI/2010.

**INTRODUCTION**

In essence, man was created by God into two groups, male and female. Men and women can be specifically distinguished by the physical and non-physical differences between them. In general, men will have physical characteristics in the form of genital organs, namely dzakar (penis) and a woman will have genital organs in the form of a normal vagina in accordance with the sex organs in humans and Islamic law does not allow surgery or sex reassignment (Aibak, 2017). Indonesia, which only recognizes the existence of two genders, namely men and women, affirms this in the laws and regulations, precisely in Law Number 1 of 1974 concerning Marriage which was amended by Law Number 16 of 2019 concerning Amendments to Law Number 1 of 1974 concerning Marriage (hereinafter referred to as the "Marriage Law") and in Law Number 24 of 2013 concerning Amendments to Law Number 23 of 2006 concerning Population Administration (hereinafter referred to as the "Population Administration Law").

Article 1 of the Marriage Law regulates the definition of marriage Marriage, namely the inner birth bond between a man and a woman as husband and wife with the aim of forming a happy and eternal family (household) based on the Supreme Godhead. This article implicitly describes the recognition of two genders, namely Male and Female as the known gender in Indonesia. This is also reinforced by Article 64 of the Population Administration Law regulating gender choice in the resident card which only lists two columns of gender choice, namely male and female. In life practice, it is not uncommon for some people to experience confusion over their gender identity. This confusion over gender identity can lead to transgender and transsexual symptoms where the sufferer feels dissatisfied with his gender identity or the result of sexual development disorders (Khuntsa) (Luyen et al., 2017).

The terms Transgender and transsexual are often considered to mean the same thing, but in fact they are different. Firlina Purwanti (Brown & Purwanti, 2002) explained that Transgender is someone who wears gender attributes that conflict with their gender naturally so that what they do also contradicts the concept of gender that is constructed in social life of society. On the other hand, transsexual is a term applied to someone who feels a feeling that he has a gender that he should not have. The explanation illustrates that a person called transgender has characteristics in the form of changes that are social only such as in their social roles, behaviors, activities and
attributes constructed by society, while the characteristics of a transsexual have something to do with the thought
that physically a person has a sex that he should not have, leading to sex reassignment by means of replacement
surgery gender or gender enhancement. Along with the development of times and technology, transgender who
carry out sex change are also referred to as transsexuals (Suraki et al., 2012).

The phenomenon of transsexuality and sex change is still something that is considered taboo or should not
be done by Indonesian society, the reason is because our country upholds religious values, traditions and eastern
values adopted by society. Sex reassignment cases involving someone who is Muslim will certainly have an impact
on applicable legal provisions (Firdaus et al., 2018). Keep in mind that not everyone is born with normal
conditions. There are some people who experience gender ambiguity or in medical terms called ambiguous
genitalia or sex ambiguity. Ambiguous genitalia or sex ambiguity is a condition in which the patient has
anatomical, physiological, and/or congenital traits that are not clear status between the male and female sexes. In
the study of Islamic jurisprudence, this group of people is referred to as khunsa (Widhiatmoko & Suyanto, 2013).

The Quran as a guide to human life, especially for Muslims, only conveys the existence of two types of
gender identity, namely male and female. Unlike the case with Islamic fiqh studies which convey the existence of
4 (four) gender identities, namely men, women, khunsta and Mukhannats / Mutarajjilah (In Islamic studies
mukhannats are men who resemble women and mutarajjilah are women who resemble men (Tobroni, 2017).
Technically khunsta consists of two types, namely first, groups that have two genitals or reproductive organs both
male and female or reproductive organs more showing a certain gender, then it is commonly called khunsta ghair
musykil. For example, when a person has multiple genders, but he has breasts, urinates from his vaginal opening,
and shows other indications that point to the female sex. The second case is people who do not have reproductive
organs that lead to a certain sex characteristic, then the person is commonly referred to as khunsta musykil (Aibak,
2017).

Ambiguity or vagueness of the reproductive organs in khunsta can cause a person to be born with an error
in determining the sex of what should be so that medical action is needed to correct or treat it. One of them is by
performing surgery. The operation in question can be in the form of sex repair or refinement surgery, as well as
sex reassignment surgery or surgery to clarify one type of sex organ. As for someone who from birth has normal
reproductive organs but has gender identity problems (Transsexual) will usually perform surgery in the form of
sex reassignment surgery (Luyen et al., 2017).

Basically, Indonesia does not have a law or regulation that specifically regulates sex change either through
genital surgery or other medical measures. However, the explanation of Article 56 paragraph (1) of the Population
Administration Law also explains that sex change is included in "other important events" determined by the
District Court. Therefore, people who have undergone sex reassignment surgery or other medical procedures to
change sex must apply to the District Court to establish their legal status for their new gender (Andriani &
Antasari, 2019).

The Population Administration Law authorizes the District Court to handle cases of sex change requests
and explains the mechanism for reporting them to the Civil Registration Office after determination, while in
relation to material law there are no laws and regulations governing it (Erwin Susilo, 2020). One of the sex change
cases that has received great attention from the Indonesian people some time ago because of its determination to
grant the request for a name and gender change from a TNI soldier and national volleyball athlete, Aprilia
Manganang. This case has opened the eyes of many people that there are several cases of sex change from male to
female allowed by the state. This then inspired Shinda Artika Indriaspuspita who is Muslim to apply for a sex
change at the Denpasar District Court from her original gender to male. In the District Court’s determination, after
examination, the doctor in his statement at the trial stated that the Petitioner had imperfect double sex, namely
having a uterus and ovaries as well as a prostate like that of men even though it was not perfect. In the end, the
court granted Shinda’s request to change her gender to male and change the Petitioner’s name to Bryan
Natadipura.

Sex reassignment either done by surgery or other medical procedures can cause legal problems for
someone who undergoes it where the position of one’s rights and obligations will also change. The thing that
should be of concern is how Islam views the status of a person who has made a sex change. In the discussion of
this study, the author will focus on the rights and status of someone who performs sex reassignment on the basis
of refinement or sex improvement in someone who suffers from multiple sex and the legal consequences of his
civil status.

Based on the background previously described, the identification of the problem to be raised is as follows:
1. What is the status of someone who makes a sex change in multiple gender sufferers in terms of Islamic law and Law Number 23 of 2006 concerning Population Administration?

2. What is the legal effect of sex change in multiple sex sufferers on a person’s civil status in terms of Islamic law and Law Number 23 of 2006 concerning Population Administration?

This study was conducted with the aim of determining the status of someone who makes sex changes in multiple gender sufferers in terms of Islamic law and Law Number 23 of 2006 concerning Population Administration. To determine the legal consequences of sex change in multiple sex sufferers on a person’s civil status is punched from Islamic law and Law Number 23 of 2006 concerning Population Administration.

METHOD

The approach method used in this study is normative juridical or normative legal research method which is carried out by examining library materials or mere secondary data. The legal materials used in this study used the types of primary legal materials, secondary legal materials, and legal materials (Soekanto & Mamudji, 2006). Meanwhile, the technique of collecting legal materials is carried out by literature studies and field studies by reviewing and analyzing library materials as well as collecting, studying, and studying data obtained directly from the field by means of interviews with the experts concerned, namely the Registrar of the Bandung District Court Class IA, MUI Bandung City, and Urology Specialists regarding the problems to be studied. The research specification used in this study is the analytical descriptive method, which is carried out by analyzing the relationship between applicable laws and regulations with legal theory and positive law implementation practices regarding the matter to be discussed.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

A. Civil Status of Multiple Sex Sufferers Who Make Sex Changes is reviewed from Islamic Law and Law Number 23 of 2006 concerning Population Administration

Ambiguous genitalia or sex ambiguity is a condition of sex abnormality characterized by the presence of reproductive organs or sexual characteristics that are less clear whether the person is female or male (Widhiatmoko & Suyanto, 2013). In Indonesian, ambiguous genitalia or sex ambiguity is known as dubious, confusing or multiple sex and in fiqh studies is known as Khuntsa. Cases of double sex or ambiguous genitalia are often found in babies who have been diagnosed with multiple gender conditions since birth so that the determination of sex will be done by a pediatric urologist or pediatrician. Multiple sex conditions are genetic conditions that can be caused by several factors that occur during a person’s pregnancy such as the use of drugs during pregnancy, a family history that also has multiple gender conditions, exposure of pregnant women to factory chemical waste and other factors (Mustafa, 2023).

Someone who has an ambiguous genital condition or multiple genders needs medical treatment as soon as possible before he grows up so that there is no confusion over his gender identity. However, not all babies are born in hospitals or adequate health facilities so it is not uncommon for multiple gender conditions not to be detected in someone early. Sex assignment errors made by midwives or doctors can cause problems in the future (Mustafa, 2023). Ambiguous genetalia or multiple gender conditions can cause legal problems when a person is raised with the wrong sex. In this condition, some people who feel discomfort over their gender often choose to take medical action to change their sex which is a refinement of their natural sex. Sex changes that also change a person’s status to male / female can certainly have implications for legal problems (Mustafa, 2023).

A person with multiple sex who decides to perform sex change will go through a long medical sex change procedure from counseling to the hormone therapy process and even genital reassignment surgery involving a team of experts ranging from psychiatrists, psychologists, surgeons, obstetrics and gynecologists, anesthesiologists, social workers, religious experts and hospitals also often involve legal experts in it. Basically, the regulation regarding sex change has not been specifically regulated in the laws and regulations in Indonesia. However, there is a regulation that provides protection and recognition of civil and legal status to a multiple gender sufferer who makes a sex change, namely the Population Administration Law. Sex change events can be classified as important events experienced by Indonesian residents as stipulated in Article 56 paragraph (1) of the Population Administration Law. The explanation of Article 56 paragraph (1) also adds that sex change is classified as "Other Important Events" that require the determination of the district court to be recorded with the implementing agency.
A multiple sex sufferer who has undergone medical treatment to perform a sex change must then also apply for a district court order to obtain an endorsement of the sex change he or she did. After the court determination is obtained, the person can apply for a change of gender identity and name in his residence document as stipulated in Article 52 and Article 56 of the Population Administration Law. This solely aims to ensure legal protection, recognition, legality and legal certainty of a person’s civil status as an Indonesian citizen as related to the purpose of population administration.

Referring to the example of a sex change case granted by the Banyumas district court in Determination Number 64/Pdt.P/2021/PN.Bms, the judge will order the Applicant to report the granted court determination to the recording officer at the Population and Civil Registration Office of the applicant’s area of residence no later than 30 (thirty) days from the receipt of a copy of the determination. Furthermore, the Employee of the Banyumas Regency Population and Civil Registration Office after receipt of a certified copy of this determination will immediately record in the ongoing register book and record the sex change, and the change of name of the Applicant’s child on the Birth Certificate of the Applicant’s child by making a marginal note (a note located on the edge of the deed or a possible part of the deed) in the register of civil registration deeds and citations of civil registration deeds. This is in accordance with what is stipulated in Article 52 of the Population Administration Law.

Based on this, as stipulated in Article 59 of the Presidential Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia Number 96 of 2018 concerning Requirements and Procedures for Population Registration and Civil Registration, after the application for sex change is granted, applicants with multiple genders must correct and cancel their Civil Registration Deed. Correction and cancellation of the Civil Registration Deed is carried out at the District/City Disdukcapil Disdukcapil or District/City Disdukcapil UPT according to the applicant’s domicile. The deed in the deed quotation and in the deed register will not be replaced by a new deed but there will be additional marginal notes about important events that occurred. Furthermore, the registration of sex changes in people with multiple sex must be submitted by fulfilling the requirements and procedures for recording as stipulated in Article 58 of the Presidential Regulation of the Republic of Indonesia Number 96 of 2018 concerning Requirements and Procedures for Population Registration and Civil Registration, namely a copy of the district court’s determination on other Important Events; citation of Civil Registration deed; attach KK or Family Card; and Attach an e-ID card or Electronic ID Card.

Sex change applications submitted to the district court have been granted several times by the district court. Based on the legal considerations of the application for the determination of sex change that has obtained permanent legal force, the judge will look for values that live in society to understand the legal value based on the value of justice. Legal sources used by judges to decide cases or others can come from laws and regulations, unwritten laws, jurisprudence, doctrine or the teachings of experts (Sudrajat, 2023). Basically, the court will try everyone according to the law by not discriminating, as stipulated in Article 10 paragraph (1) of Law No. 48 of 2009 concerning Judicial Power, stipulated that the court may not refuse to tried, examine, and decide cases that have been submitted to him for reasons of lack of law or the law is unclear so that it has become the duty of the judge to dig and find the law that lives in the community (Sudrajat, 2023).

Based on several determinations of sex change applications, judges will consider granting applicants from various aspects such as psychic, physical, religious and social aspects of a person. When a Muslim person submits a sex change application to the district court, Islamic Law will also be considered for the judge to grant the sex change request. Basically, Islamic law forbids sex change because it includes acts to change the creation of Allah SWT and also forbids homosexuals, lesbians, and takhannuts (men who dress and behave like women or vice versa) just as Allah SWT says in the Qur’an Surat An-Nisa Verse 119 which means: "...and I will tell them (to change God’s creation), and then they will really change it. Whoever makes Satan a protector other than Allah, Verily suffers a real loss."

However, when a medical procedure in the form of a sex change is carried out on a person who has multiple genders (Khuntsa) with the aim of perfecting the sex he has, the law can be done (mubah). It is the provision of Allah Almighty that jinns and humans are created into only two gender groups, namely male and female. The term Khuntsa itself is unknown in the Qur’an and is not a third gender, but a Khuntsa needs to be classified into a gender according to its inclination. If a medical act to change sex has a tendency to provide benefit (benefit) and is not more likely to give madlarat (harm) then the law can be mubah (permissible), but if the act causes madlarat (damage / harm) then the law is haram (Djuaeni, 2023).

Other Shar’i postulates can be said to justify sex change as long as the sex change is in the nature of repairing or perfecting the reproductive organs. Islamic law allows and encourages a person to make a sex
change if the purpose is for the greater benefit. Especially when the discomfort of gender identity felt by a person is categorized as a disease, Islamic law advises the person to seek treatment and treatment. This is as explained in the Hadith of the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) which means: “Heal, O servants of Allah! For verily God does not bring sickness except to cure it, except one sickness which is old sickness.”

The issue of sex change according to Islamic religious views has also been regulated by MUI scholars in a fatwa on Sex Change and Improvement Number: 03 / Munas / VIII / MUI / 2010 dated July 27, 2010 that medical actions both in the form of surgery and other actions that are in the nature of genital enhancement for a khuntsa (a double sex sufferer) the law is permissible and its implementation must be based on medical considerations from expert doctors and not only considerations of a purely psychic nature. The MUI fatwa itself is a legal opinion or decision issued by the MUI as an institution that gathers scholars and religious experts in Indonesia to direct Muslims regarding actual problems encountered by Muslims. The existence of MUI fatwas is not included in Indonesia’s positive law and the matters regulated therein are not coercive and legally binding for Muslims in Indonesia unless a fatwa is later adopted into a form of legislation (Riadi, 2013).

Fatwa on Sex Change and Refinement Number: 03/Munas/VIII/MUI/2010 dated July 27, 2010 was used in legal considerations of several cases of sex change applications in district courts that were granted by judges, namely in the determination of Banyumas PN Number 64/Pdt.P/2021/PN.Bms and the determination of Denpasar PN Number 624/Pdt.P/2021/PN.Jp.ps on the basis that sex change applications for various Islamic applicants are open in the sense of changing sex completely or thorough but is a form of refinement of the shape of the genitals due to the presence of multiple genital conditions as evidenced by a doctor’s statement. The MUI fatwa itself is not always used as a judge’s consideration in deciding sex change cases even though the applicant is Muslim as well as legal considerations in the case of application 1188/Pdt.P/2018/PN. Sby, so that the MUI fatwa is not an absolute requirement for the granting of sex change requests for applicants who are Muslim (Karim et al., 2021).

Regarding the MUI fatwa that regulates sex change, the act of a person making a sex change not only has implications for positive law in Indonesia, but also related to human relations with Allah SWT and personal responsibility to Allah SWT as Muslims. Medical considerations from doctors related to multiple gender conditions that a person has in submitting a sex change application to the district court are also important to present as evidence at trial so that a sex change application can be granted. The applicant needs to clearly prove that he has a dual gender condition or ambiguous genitalia and has made the refinement of the sex he should have. This doctor’s statement will then be taken into consideration by the judge in deciding the case of a sex change application. Several court decisions that grant sex changes in people with multiple sex also explain that the results of a person’s chromosome examination are also the main basis for determining sex in Indonesia and internationally, so the results of chromosome examination also need to be attached as evidence that there has been an error in determining sex in a person with multiple sex.

B. The legal consequences of Sex Change are reviewed from Islamic Law and Law Number 23 of 2006 concerning Population Administration

Based on the provisions of the Population Administration Law, civil registration is the right and obligation of every resident who experiences important events in his life so that important events can be proven concretely and can have the legal force of their existence. This has legal consequences on determining a person’s civil status. When the sex change in multiple gender sufferers has obtained a court determination and has been reported to the recording officer at the Population and Civil Registration Office of the applicant’s area of residence no later than 30 (thirty) days from the receipt of a copy of the determination so that later the Population and Civil Registration Office Employee will immediately record in the ongoing register book and record the sex change. By making a note in the Civil Registration Deed Register and the Civil Registration Deed Citation, the person’s civil status will change according to his new gender.

Sex change and the term Khuntsa have no specific explanation in the Qur’an as the primary source of law for Muslims. Some Qur’anic propositions can even be the legal basis for prohibiting sex change as stated by Allah Almighty in the Qur’an Surah Al-Hujurat verse 13 which means: “O man, verily We created you from a man and a woman and made you into nations and tribes so that you might know each other. Indeed, the noblest among you in the sight of Allah is the most pious among you. Verily, Allah is All-Knowing, All-Knowing.” In addition, Surah An-Nisa verse 119 also states which means that: “. . . and I will tell them (to change God’s creation), and then they will really change it. Whoever makes Satan a protector other than Allah, Verily suffers a real loss.” The two verses of the Qur’an explain that there are only two genders known to man so there is no third sex and sex change includes the act of changing the creation of Allah Almighty who has been perfected so
that the law is haram. This is supported by the Fatwa of the Indonesian Ulema Council Number 03 / MUNAS-VIII / MUI / 2010 concerning Change and Enhancement of Genitals has stated that sex reassignment surgery is unlawful if done intentionally without any medical conditions related to a person's physique.

When a Muslim who does not have a physical condition that he is a khuntsa or a sufferer of multiple genders, MUI stipulates in the Fatwa of the Indonesian Ulema Council Number 03/MUNAS-VIII/MUI/2010 concerning Genital Change and Refinement that even if he has made a sex change will not have legal consequences on the person's civil status. The sex of the person will be considered the same as before the operation or medical procedure of sex change, even if the court grants the person's sex change request. Unlike the case with surgery or medical action sex change in someone who has multiple genders or Khuntsa, Fatwa of the Indonesian Ulema Council Number 03 / MUNAS-VIII / MUI / 2010 allows sex enhancement for him with medical considerations and not just psychological considerations. So that the sex change he does will have shari'a legal implications and cause legal consequences, namely changing the legal position of the person's sex according to his new gender after consummation even though he has not obtained a court determination regarding the change in status.

Based on this, then after a dual sex sufferer who is Muslim performs medical action to change his sex, he will be directly considered included in the new sex group. This will certainly affect the rights and obligations of a Muslim in religion both in carrying out worship, inheritance, marriage, and other matters according to the provisions of the new gender law. However, submitting an application for recording sex change in multiple sex sufferers is very important to do so that the sex change event carried out has permanent legal force based on a court determination. If this is not done, it will have an impact on the difficulty and lack of legal certainty regarding a person's gender status as an Indonesian citizen. This is solely also done so that the rights of every resident can be fulfilled, as the purpose of the implementation of the Population Administration itself is stated in the general explanation of the Population Administration Law, which is as follows:

1. to provide identity validity and legal certainty over Resident documents for each Residence Event and Important Event experienced by the Resident;
2. provide protection of the civil rights status of the population;
3. provide accurate, complete, up-to-date and easily accessible population data;
4. creating orderly population administration; and
5. provide population data that becomes a basic reference for related sectors in the implementation of every government, development, and community activity.

Therefore, in filing a sex change application for multiple sex sufferers, it is important for the Applicant to present evidence and present an Expert in the trial who can support the granting of the case (Sudrajat, 2023). This is because in civil cases, it is the parties who have the obligation to prove, and not the judge. It is the judge who will order the parties to present evidence or in other words it is the judge who charges the parties with evidence (Butarbutar, 2010). As for determining the sex of a person, there are at least 5 important aspects that will be considered by the judge so that it requires the submission of evidence and experts from the applicant so that the application can be granted, (Kurniawati & Herni Widanarti, 2017) i.e. Chromosomal Aspect. Aspects of the primary genitals (internal genital organs i.e. testes or ovaries). Aspects of secondary genitalia (external genital organs i.e. penis as well as vulva and vagina), hormonal aspect, Psychological aspect.

As in the case of the application for sex change in multiple sex sufferers which was granted by the judge in the decision of the Denpasar District Court Number 624 / Pdt.P / 2021 / PN.Dps, the Applicant submitted evidence letters including a Certificate from Grasia Clinic, a Certificate from Prof.Dr.dr. Wimpie Pangkahil, SpAnd-K, Certificate from dr. Agustina Sjenny, Sp.KJ, X-ray examination results, and the Applicant also submitted two experts, namely Andrology Specialist and Mental Medicine Doctor.

**CONCLUSION**

The Population Administration Law opens opportunities for sex change, especially for multiple sex sufferers where a person with multiple sex who has made a sex change needs to obtain legal certainty by recording the event based on the determination of the District Court as stipulated in Article 56 paragraph (1) of the Population Administration Law. Islamic law also allows sex change if it is done for someone suffering from multiple gender conditions (khuntsa) as a form of treatment as stipulated in Fatwa No. 03/MUNASVIII/MUI/2010.

The legal consequence of sex change in multiple sex sufferers in terms of the Population Administration Law is the change in a person’s sex status after his new gender after a court determination that grants the relevant request and an important event of sex change has been recorded. Unlike the legal consequences of medical actions,
sex change in multiple sex sufferers from the view of Islamic Law, namely the sex change carried out will have shari'ī legal implications and cause legal consequences, namely the change of the legal position of the person's sex according to his new sex after consummation even though he has not obtained a court determination regarding the change in status.

Sex change is an act that can cause legal problems. Therefore, it is necessary to conduct counseling by authorized officials, namely the Indonesian Ulema Council and the District Court to the public regarding the opening of opportunities for people who have certain medical conditions to make sex changes on the basis of treatment. So that the public knows and understands about sex changes in people with multiple genders and their legal consequences so that they know the procedures for recording sex changes regulated in Article 56 paragraph (1) of the Population Administration Law. Recording sex change events, especially in people with multiple genders, is very important to do. Therefore, a person who has undergone medical refinement of his genitals needs to immediately apply for a sex change even though according to Islamic Law the legal position of the person's sex changes according to his new sex solely for the fulfillment of one's rights and obligations.

REFERENCES
Brown, J., & Purwanti, F. (2002). Registration of Land and Women’s Land Rights on Java: Why so many married couples register marital property in the name of one spouse and what has been the impact on women’s land rights’, in. *Seattle: Rural Development Institute*.